Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 1 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
3	
4	
5	IN RE: ROCK 'N PLAY SLEEPER) CASE NO.:
6	MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES, AND)1:19-md-2903
7	PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION)
8)
9	
10	CONFIDENTIAL
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	DEPOSITION OF BRUCE SILVERMAN
16	VOLUME I
17	REMOTELY IN LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA
18	THURSDAY, OCTOBER 28, 2021
19	
2 0	
21	
22	REPORTED BY:
23	NATALIE PARVIZI-AZAD, CSR, RPR, RSR
24	CSR NO. 14125
25	JOB NO. 4846762
	Page 1

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 2 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
2	WESTERN DISTRICT OF NEW YORK
3	
4	
5	IN RE: ROCK 'N PLAY SLEEPER) CASE NO.:
6	MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES, AND)1:19-md-2903
7	PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION)
8)
9	
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	DEPOSITION OF BRUCE SILVERMAN, VOLUME I
15	TAKEN ON BEHALF OF THE DEFENDANTS
16	REMOTELY VIA ZOOM VIDEO CONFERENCING, IN
17	LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA, BEGINNING AT
18	9:03 A.M. AND ENDING AT 7:22 P.M., ON
19	THURSDAY, OCTOBER 28, 2021, BEFORE
2 0	NATALIE PARVIZI-AZAD, CERTIFIED SHORTHAND
21	REPORTER NUMBER 14125.
22	
2 3	
24	
25	
	Dage 2
	Page 2

1	APPEARANCES
2	
3	FOR THE PLAINTIFFS:
4	BEASLEY, ALLEN LAW FIRM
5	BY: JAMES EUBANK, ESQ.
6	BY: PAUL EVANS, ESQ.
7	BY: DEMET BASAR, ESQ.
8	218 COMMERCE STREET
9	MONTGOMERY, ALABAMA 36104
	(800) 898-2034
10	JAMES.EUBANK@BEASLEYALLEN.COM
11	PAUL.EVANS@BEASLEYALLEN.COM
12	DEMET.BASAR@BEASLEYALLEN.COM
13	
14	FOR THE DEFENDANTS:
15	GOODWIN PROCTER, LLP
16	BY: MATTHEW P. KANNY, ESQ.
17	520 BROADWAY
18	SUITE 500
19	SANTA MONICA, CALIFORNIA 90401
	(424) 252-6400
20	MKANNY@GOODWINLAW.COM
21	
22	ALSO PRESENT:
23	ROB FENTON, VIDEOGRAPHER
24	
25	
	Page 3

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 4 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	INDEX	
2		
3	WITNESS	
4	BRUCE SILVERMAN	
5	EXAMINATION BY MR. KANNY 7	
6	EXAMINATION BY MR. EUBANK 316	
7	EXAMINATION BY MR. EUBANK 318	
8	EXAMINATION BY MR. KANNY 345	
9	EXAMINATION BY MR. EUBANK 361	
10	EXAMINATION BY MR. KANNY 363	
11		
12	EXHIBITS	
13	EXHIBIT NO. DESCRIPTION PAGE	
14	EXHIBIT 1 NOTICE OF DEPOSITION 15	
15	EXHIBIT 2 EXPERT REPORT 24	
16	EXHIBIT 3 FORBES ARTICLE DATED 111	
	MAY 29, 2010	
17	EXHIBIT 4 INVOICE TO-DATE 183	
18	EXHIBIT 5 CONSOLIDATED AMENDED 206	
19	COMPLAINT	
20	EXHIBIT 6 MATTEL PRODUCT DELUXE COPY 274	
	INFORMATION SHEETS	
21	EXHIBIT 7 MATTEL PRODUCT DELUXE COPY 274	
22	INFORMATION SHEETS	
23	EXHIBIT 8 LOS ANGELES BUSINESS 320	
24	JOURNAL ARTICLE	
25		
	Page 4	

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 5 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	REMOTELY IN LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA	
2	THURSDAY, OCTOBER 28, 2021, 9:03 A.M.	
3		
4	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Good morning. We	
5	are on the record. The time is 9:03 a.m.	09:03:01
6	Pacific Time. Today is October 28th, 2021.	
7	Please note that the microphones are sensitive	
8	and may pick up whispering, private	
9	conversations, and cellular interference.	
10	Please turn off all cellphones or place them	09:03:17
11	away from the microphones as they can interfere	
12	with the deposition audio. Audio and video	
13	recording will continue to take place unless	
14	all parties agree to go off the record.	
15	My name is Rob Fenton. I'm the notary	09:03:30
16	video technician with Veritext Legal Solutions	
17	located in Los Angeles, California. The court	
18	reporter is Natalie Parvizi-Azad from Veritext	
19	Legal Solutions.	
20	We are recording these proceedings	09:03:42
21	over videoconference technology due to	
22	COVID-19. This is media unit one for the video	
23	deposition of Bruce Silverman in the action	
24	titled in re: Fisher-Price Rock 'n Play	
25	Sleeper Marketing Sales Practices and Products	09:04:02
		Page 5

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 6 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Liability Litigation. This deposition is being	
2	taken on behalf of the defendants. And the NDL	
3	number is 1:19-MD-2903.	
4	I'm not related to any party in this	
5	action, nor am I financially interested in the	09:04:21
6	outcome. Counsel and everyone present in the	
7	room and everyone attending remotely will now	
8	state their appearances and affiliations for	
9	the record.	
10	If there are any objections to	09:04:31
11	proceeding, please state them at the time of	
12	your appearance, beginning with the noticing	
13	attorney.	
14	MR. KANNY: Good morning, everyone.	
15	This is Matt Kanny with Goodwin Procter on	09:04:39
16	behalf of the defendants. I will be taking the	
17	deposition today.	
18	MR. EUBANK: My name is James Eubank,	
19	at Beasley Allen, appearing on behalf of the	
20	plaintiffs. And I will be defending the	09:04:55
21	deposition today.	
22	MS. BASAR: My name is Demet Basar	
23	from Beasley Allen, appearing on behalf of the	
24	plaintiffs.	
25	MR. EVANS: My name is Paul Evans with	09:05:05
		Page 6

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 7 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	Beasley Allen, appearing on behalf of	
2	plaintiffs.	
3	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: Thank you. Could	
4	the court reporter please administer the oath.	
5	THE CERTIFIED STENOGRAPHER: Please	
6	raise your right hand to be sworn.	
7		
8	BRUCE SILVERMAN,	
9	having declared under penalty of perjury to	
10	tell the truth, was examined and testified as	
11	follows:	
12		
13	EXAMINATION	
14	BY MR. KANNY:	
15	Q. Good good morning.	09:05:35
16	A. Good morning.	
17	Q. Could you please state and spell your	
18	full name for the record?	
19	A. Yes. It's Bruce G. Silverman. That's	
20	B-R-U-C-E, initial G, S-I-L-V-E-R-M-A-N.	09:05:43
21	Q. And Mr. Silverman, what is your date	
22	of birth?	
23	A. It's February 16th, 1945.	
24	Q. And where do you currently reside?	
25	A. I reside at 3168 Dona, D-O-N-A, Mema,	09:06:03
		Page 7

1	president at the time?	
2	A. Yes. I was the vice president I	
3	was made a senior vice president I think	
4	gosh. I I think it was when I first got to	
5	Los Angeles.	10:47:35
6	Q. And you ultimately left in 1980	
7	Ogilvy; correct?	
8	A. I left at the very end of 1980,	
9	literally on the last day of the year.	
10	Q. Why did you leave?	10:47:50
11	A. I was recruited away by another agency	
12	called Bozell & Jacobs.	
13	Q. In all of your time at well, let	
14	me you list on your client list for Ogilvy,	
15	Mattel?	10:48:20
16	A. That's correct. That was at the Los	
17	Angeles office.	
18	Q. So your work for Mattel would have	
19	been from 1977 to 1980?	
20	A. Yeah. Very late '77 through 1980.	10:48:36
21	Q. What did what did what did you	
22	personally do for Mattel?	
23	A. Well, first of all, as executive	
24	creative director, I I was responsible for	
25	all of the creative work that the agency	10:48:59
	Pa	ige 73

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 9 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	produced including all of the work that we did
2	for Mattel. Mattel was our largest account at
3	Ogilvy LA. It happened to be one of the
4	largest accounts, at that time, that was
5	handled by Ogilvy & Mather on a global basis as 10:49:14
6	well as in the US. We were at the time
7	Mattel's only agency. So we were responsible
8	for all the girls' toys, things like Barbie and
9	baby dolls; all the boys' toys, things like Hot
10	Wheels, all the everything in between. So I 10:49:31
11	was responsible for the quality of the work.
12	I was responsible and I also I
13	created a lot of work. I created a a
14	campaign Barbie called "here comes Barbie fun."
15	It used the song from a movie called here 10:49:53
16	comes I'm trying to remember the name of the
17	movie. We we bought the rights to the music
18	and created a theme song. "Here comes Barbie
19	fun." And that was literally a full campaign
20	for Barbie. It was sort of a new idea that all 10:50:11
21	of the Barbie commercials and would relate
22	to each other, the various Barbie products. I
23	did some commercials personally that I really
24	got my hands got down on the ground and
25	did created some commercials for Hot Wheels. 10:50:26
	Page 74

Ť		
1	I created commercials for a product called	
2	Slime. It was a gooey product that came in its	
3	own garbage can. Kind of fun.	
4	I did I was very involved in the	
5	launch of the series of products by a division 10:50:4	13
6	of Mattel called Mattel Electronics that made	
7	handheld electronic games, and then later	
8	introduced a product that I actually came up	
9	with the name for called Intellivision, which	
10	was a very, very early kind of game computer. 10:51:0	01
11	Q. Did Mattel, to your knowledge, own or	
12	was affiliated with Fisher-Price at the time?	
13	A. No. They acquired I don't quite	
14	remember when they acquired Fisher-Price, but	
15	it was well after I worked on the Mattel 10:51:3	31
16	account. In fact, Mattel had their own what	
17	they called their preschool product line.	
18	Q. Did Ogilvy ever work for Fisher-Price?	
19	A. Not my knowledge. They didn't work	
20	for Fisher-Price during the years I worked 10:51:4	19
21	there.	
22	Q. Do you know what baby durables are?	
23	A. Baby durables?	
24	Q. Yes.	
25	A. I'm not familiar with that. 10:52:0	00
	Page 75	

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 11 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. I don't believe so at I I don't	
2	think so. You know, it's a while ago. I've	
3	have there were a lot of clients. In	
4	paragraphs in paragraphs 13, 4, 15, you	
5	know, I listed a few of the clients that	10:58:13
6	some of the better-known clients. But those	
7	agencies had much longer client lists than	
8	those that are listed in those paragraphs. But	
9	I do reference	
10	Q. (Indiscernible).	10:58:24
11	A I reference clients at the end	
12	of end of Exhibit B.	
13	Q. And and just so I'm clear, you	
14	don't recall, as you sit here today, ever	
15	working while you were at Bozell or BBDO West	10:58:40
16	for any client that manufactured or sold baby	
17	durable products, as we defined it earlier?	
18	A. I don't think so.	
19	Q. And if you look at page 63 through 75	
20	of your CV which lists your clients, there is	10:59:06
21	no client listed here on this list that is a	
22	manufacturer or seller of baby gear durable	
23	products; correct?	
24	A. Factory To You stores, which was a	
25	it's a retail chain that Asher/Gould	10:59:41
	Pa	age 80

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 12 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	represented, they may have sold some they	
2	may have sold what you're calling durables	
3	baby durables. Big Lots may have sold baby	
4	durables. I'm just looking just to see if	
5	there is anything else, but I don't I	11:00:05
6	don't I don't have a category. Certainly, I	
7	don't list a category of of baby durables.	
8	Q. And for those two retailers that you	
9	described, do you recall ever working with them	
10	in connection with any advertising campaign or	11:00:38
11	any marketing campaign in connection with baby	
12	durables?	
13	A. I don't recall. Baby durable products	
14	may have been included in some of the	
15	advertising we did. The nature of those	11:00:50
16	clients was that you would frequently, you	
17	know, show lots of stuff that was sold at the	
18	store. So I really don't remember the specific	
19	products all that much that were sold there.	
20	Q. But you don't recall	11:01:02
21	A. I can tell you I mean, I know they	
22	sold all kinds of things. It just you know,	
23	I know they sold T-shirts and socks and all	
24	kinds of things like that.	
25	Q. Right. But you don't, as you sit here	11:01:18
	Pag	ge 81

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 13 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	MR. EUBANK: Well, then I would object	
2	to form as vague and ambiguous as he just said	
3	he thinks he does, which is not an affirmative	
4	or a negative, so it's vague.	
5	BY MR. KANNY:	11:30:29
6	Q. All right. So what we talked about	
7	earlier today, Mr. Silverman, just to make the	
8	record clear. Baby durables or I think you	
9	mentioned baby gear as defined by some internal	
10	documents that you saw from Fisher-Price and	11:30:40
11	Mattel products made for baby care and	
12	specifically includes things like bassinets,	
13	bouncers, swings, rockers, sleepers, and	
14	gliders, but do not include items that are	
15	baby items that are disposable like diapers,	11:30:56
16	formula, and like diapers and formula and	
17	clothes, I think I also said earlier.	
18	So with that clarification, it's true,	
19	isn't it, that from the beginning of your	
20	career through today, you've never worked for	11:31:11
21	any company that manufacturers or sells baby	
22	durable products?	
23	MR. EUBANK: And I want to	
24	objection. Asked and answered.	
25	THE WITNESS: I can't could you	11:31:23
	Pag	ge 102

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 14 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	restate the question so I know how to answer	
2	yes or no?	
3	MR. KANNY: Sure. Why don't we have	
4	the court reporter read it back since I'm	
5	getting a little tired here.	11:31:36
6	(Record read.)	
7	THE WITNESS: I actually, I worked	
8	on the Sears account. And they back then,	
9	way back then, they probably sold that stuff.	
10	But I I don't remember ever being involved	11:32:27
11	in doing advertising specifically for those	
12	products. So other than that, I think the	
13	answer would be to your question would be	
14	yes.	
15	MR. KANNY: Let's go to you guys	11:32:43
16	want to take a five-minute break?	
17	THE WITNESS: I would welcome that.	
18	MR. EUBANK: Sure.	
19	MR. KANNY: Okay. Let's take a	
20	five-minute break then. Thank you.	11:32:53
21	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are going off	
22	the record at 11:33 a.m.	
23	(Recess.)	
24	THE VIDEOGRAPHER: We are back on the	
25	record at 11:42 a.m.	11;41:31
	Pag	e 103

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 15 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	mostly moms in the focus groups. We did some
2	groups with dads, but it was mostly moms. And
3	the moms would talk about the experiences they
4	were having, including the difficulties they
5	were having. 12:18:42
6	Q. Were any particular products
7	referenced in any of those focus groups?
8	A. Well, I mean, they you know, moms
9	would talk about bassinets, they'd talk about
10	cribs, playpens, all those kind of things. 12:19:06
11	They certainly weren't by brand. We didn't
12	talk about specific products. But consumers
13	talked about you know, in a focus group, the
14	name tries to define what it is. They tried to
15	focus on a particular subject, but the 12:19:19
16	subjects sometimes the discussion group
17	gets discussion takes interesting turns that
18	the group wants to talk about. And good focus
19	group moderators will try to steer the
20	conversation back to what we specifically want 12:19:42
21	to learn. "We" meaning the advertising people.
22	But they also know that it's important to let
23	the group go, otherwise the group becomes
24	unresponsive. That's just that's just the
25	art ever of moderating focus groups. 12:19:54
	Page 129

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 16 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

- 6	
1	Q. So just to get a clear answer, none of
2	the focus groups' purpose was product specific?
3	MR. EUBANK: Objection. Asked and
4	answered.
5	THE WITNESS: The purpose of the focus 12:25:25
6	groups was not to find ways to help sell
7	products. That wasn't what the campaign was
8	about.
9	BY MR. KANNY:
10	Q. And, peripherally, there may have been 12:25:34
11	some discussions of baby products in those, but
12	that wasn't the purpose of any of those focus
13	groups?
14	MR. EUBANK: Objection. Asked and
15	answered three or four times now. 12:25:45
16	THE WITNESS: It's the purpose of
17	the focus groups was for to understand the
18	needs and wants of consumers that fell into the
19	target audience for the "Baby-Cal" campaign.
20	When you're interesting in finding out needs 12:26:04
21	and wants, you're going to the the
22	conversations what you learn is going to
23	include a lot of things that include the
24	products that consumers buy, both what you
25	would call "durables" as well as expendables. 12:26:18
	Page 134

1	BY MR. KANNY:
2	Q. Right. But the purpose of it wasn't
3	to find out the needs and wants of particular
4	products, was it?
5	A. It was not to find the needs and wants 12:26:30
6	for particular products, no.
7	Q. And this was about ten years before
8	the Rock 'n Play sleeper was ever sold?
9	A. That sounds right.
10	Q. If you go to paragraph 21 of your 12:26:57
11	report I'm sorry paragraph 40, which is
12	on page 13.
13	A. I'm sorry, 40?
14	Q. Yes.
15	A. Okay. 12:27:23
16	Q. It says:
17	"I was involved in dozens of packaging
18	projects during my long agency career for
19	many different kinds of products, including
20	beverages, condiments, automotive products 12:27:30
21	such as motor oil and, relevant to this
22	matter, products primarily purchased by
23	parents for use by children."
24	What packaging projects were you
25	involved with over your agency career 12:27:47
	Page 135

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 18 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	career, that dealt primarily with products	
2	purchased by parents for use by children?	
3	A. Let's see. Breakfast cereals, you	
4	know, the kids' cereals such as Cocoa	
5	Pebbles and Fruity Pebbles made by Post; 12:28:	09
6	various candy bars like Hershey's and Reese's	
7	Peanut Butter Cups, and some other Hershey	
8	products; puppies, I actually did advertising	
9	for a chain of pet food pet shops that was	
10	owned by Mars, Incorporated. And one of the 12:28:	38
11	things we found was that parents love to buy	
12	puppies if when because they had	
13	children. Toys, because I worked on Mattel.	
14	And, from time to time, we would be	
15	have discussions with Mattel about ideas for 12:28:	53
16	packaging for some of their new toys.	
17	Particularly, in the toy business at least	
18	when I worked on it there were staples like	
19	Barbie and Hot Wheels. But there were also new	
20	toys introduced every year that, basically, 12:29:	09
21	might have lasted one season, sometimes two.	
22	And so, a lot of packaging there. And and	
23	some others. Soft drinks, other food products,	
24	toaster pastries specifically designed for	
25	kids. One was a product Nabisco made called 12:29:	39
	Page 136	

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 19 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	it's Krazy Glazy, with a K. It's "crazy" with	
2	a K. And there was another one called Sooper	
3	Cookies, S-O-O-P-E-R, K-O-O-K-I-E. And they	
4	were toaster pastries for kids.	
5	So it was an awful lot also	12:29:58
6	clothing products, things like that. So, you	
7	know, an awful lot of you well, you don't	
8	do much packaging for clothing. I take that	
9	one back. But you certainly do for packaged	
10	good products and things like that.	12:30:16
11	Q. So except for the toys for Mattel back	
12	in '77 through '80 when Mattel didn't own	
13	Fisher-Price, all of your packaging projects	
14	that you just mentioned all relate to food and	
15	soda and other consumables; correct?	12:30:31
16	A. Gosh. Let me think about that for a	
17	moment. One of the things that we created	
18	well, it it was for fast food. You know,	
19	we they still do it. They have promotion	
20	items at fast food places. One of my clients	12:31:05
21	was Hardee's. And the campaign was very, very	
22	kid oriented. You know, the advertising was	
23	directed to both we had commercials very	
24	specifically directed to kids and commercials	
25	directed to adults where we were promising kind	12:31:28
	Pag	je 137

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 20 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. Well, I'm not sure that you know,	
2	I I do trademark work, so I the word	
3	"confusion," at least in what I do in trademark	
4	work has to do with source and issues with	
5	that. But I think consumers would not	13:39:58
6	necessarily know that this product is a product	
7	that they know and feel good about.	
8	Q. Have you ever worked on any	
9	advertising campaigns for companies that sold	
10	any type of baby products?	13:40:12
11	A. Yes.	
12	Q. What what companies?	
13	A. Mead Johnson nutritional is the	
14	manufacturer was and still is the	
15	manufacturer of Enfamil. It's the leading baby	13:40:27
16	formula product in the world, actually. But	
17	when I was working on it, in the early 1970's,	
18	it was probably US only. And when I worked on	
19	Mattel account, they had a preschool division.	
20	I honestly don't remember the products. It's,	13:40:49
21	you know, a long time ago. And it wasn't the	
22	most part of Mattel's business. But we	
23	certainly did sell products that were at least	
24	preschool products. I'm not sure how young	
25	they went.	13:41:03
	Pag	e 152
	_	

1	Q. Were they products for infants, if you
2	recall?
3	A. As I just said, I don't recall.
4	Q. And Mattel, at that time, was
5	primarily making only toys; is that right? 13:41:14
6	A. Back in those days, Mattel made toys
7	and they made games and they also sometimes
8	licensed the names of their products for other
9	purposes. And they had a line of preschool
10	products which, you know, my as best as I 13:41:37
11	can remember and I honestly don't remember
12	really well they were toys for preschool
13	children. I just don't remember to what how
14	young they went as far as their products go.
15	Q. If you look at and other than the 13:41:58
16	Enfamil and the Mattel preschool, any other
17	advertising campaigns you worked on that
18	involved products for babies or infants?
19	A. Yeah. Kimberly-Clark was in the
20	diapers business and I did some advertising for 13:42:25
21	diapers.
22	Q. Other than Enfamil with the Mattel
23	preschool and diapers, any other products
24	any other campaigns you worked on that involved
25	product for babies? 13:42:40
	Page 153

1	A. I don't recall others.
2	Q. And I'm just going to clarify my own
3	question that it's the preschool I don't
4	think you understood what age those products
5	were or what whether those products were for 13:42:55
6	infants or for younger kids; right?
7	A. I didn't say I didn't understand. I
8	said I can't remember whether they went
9	whether their product line included products
10	for infants or toddlers. 13:43:09
11	Q. Sure. If you look at paragraph 50,
12	it's where you reference the Enfamil baby
13	formula account.
14	A. Yes.
15	Q. And I just want to go to the 13:43:22
16	paragraph 27 now. At the bottom of that, you
17	refer to products ranging from financial
18	services to baby formula. Is the baby formula
19	referenced there the Enfamil?
20	A. Yes. 13:43:38
21	Q. And paragraph 40, the products
22	primarily so at the last two lines, it says,
23	"products primarily purchased by parents for
24	use by children." We already covered that
25	earlier today; right? 13:43:58
	Page 154

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 23 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	A. I think we did, yes.	
2	Q. Okay. And if you now go to	
3	paragraph 50, we talked about this a little bit	
4	earlier today. But you said that you did focus	
5	groups for Geisinger health system pediatric	13:44:16
6	practices?	
7	A. Yes. We did it for pediatric	
8	practices and other specialty practices and	
9	that Geisinger	
10	Q. So when did you those?	13:44:29
11	A. 2000 it might have been as early as	
12	2016. Definitely 2017, '18 and '19.	
13	Q. And what were the purpose of those	
14	focus groups?	
15	A. The development of advertising. It	13:44:53
16	says it right in that paragraph.	
17	Q. For what types of advertisements?	
18	A. Advertising the the what do you	
19	mean by "what types of advertising"?	
20	Q. What was the well, let me ask a	13:45:06
21	separate question. Strike that question.	
22	Did the focus groups help inform the	
23	type of advertising you were composing for	
24	Geisinger health system?	
25	A. What the focus groups taught us was,	13:45:20
	Page	e 155

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 24 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

-		
1	one, what what consumers were looking for.	
2	And it was, again, it was mostly moms over	
3	there in central Pennsylvania what they were	
4	looking for from from a pediatrician. You	
5	know, our focus groups consisted of young	13:45:49
6	mothers. And, actually, not just young. You	
7	know, mothers of everything from infants up	
8	to teenagers. But what they were looking	
9	for from for from pediatricians or	
10	from a pediatrician's practice.	13:46:06
11	That Geisinger, at that time,	
12	operated somewhere between 150 and 200 medical	
13	offices. They called them clinics. And they	
14	had specialty practices, in addition to, you	
15	know, just primary care practices. So they had	13:46:24
16	specialists, including, you know,	
17	pediatricians, cardiologists, et cetera.	
18	And so, we were doing this to learn	
19	what consumers were looking for, from a	
20	pediatrician practice, in in that part of	13:46:42
21	Pennsylvania. Some of them were already	
22	Geisinger patients. Some of them were not	
23	Geisinger patients. Some of them didn't have	
24	an ongoing relationship with a pediatrician.	
25	It's it's the rust belt. A lot of those	13:46:58
	Pag	re 156

1	people were pretty poor.	
2	And and, you know, this was	
3	something that Geisinger, at that time, really	
4	wanted to put emphasis on into from a	
5	marketing standpoint, was to build their	13:47:13
6	network, to build their system. They	
7	operated they operated seven or eight	
8	hospitals throughout Pennsylvania and southern	
9	New Jersey.	
10	And it's sort of a vertically	13:47:28
11	integrated business, health care. If you can	
12	become a primary care physician or specialty	
13	physician for a patient and that patient needs	
14	to go to the hospital, they're going to end up	
15	going to the system's hospital, more often than	13:47:41
16	not.	
17	Q. So would it be fair that the primary	
18	purpose of those focus groups was unrelated to	
19	the sale of any baby durable products?	
20	A. The purpose of those the ultimate	13:48:05
21	purpose of those focus groups was to develop a	
22	advertising campaign to attract patients to	
23	Geisinger's services.	
24	Q. Do you recall whether, in any of those	
25	focus groups, anyone mentioned the Rock 'n Play	13:48:18
	Page	e 157

- 1		
1	sleeper product?	
2	A. I do not I I really don't	
3	remember. But I I I don't remember that	
4	happening.	
5	Q. And we talked about the the focus 1	3:48:45
6	groups you did for the was it baby cal,	
7	baby I forget the name of the project that	
8	you did for the State of California back in the	
9	90's?	
10	A. The there was one was "baby 1	3:49:00
11	cal."	
12	Q. Baby-Cal. In any of those focus	
13	groups, did the did SIDS ever come up?	
14	A. SIDS? Yes, SIDS absolutely came up.	
15	By the way, there were two programs and I 1	3:49:17
16	was trying to remember the name of the other	
17	program. The first was "baby cal," which	
18	really was both prenatal and postnatal. And	
19	then, the second was called First 5. And First	
20	5 is still going. Every once in a while, I see 1	3:49:36
21	advertising for it.	
22	So First 5 was, as the name implies,	
23	programs designed to help parents do a better	
24	job hopefully a better job of being involved	
25	with their children during the first five years 1	3:49:51
	Page	158

51		
1	I don't I I'm not sure if that was	
2	alleged in the operative complaint or not. I	
3	don't recall, but my focus as I've said, my	
4	focus had to do with whether or not this was a	
5	dangerous product for infants to sleep it. 14:49	:16
6	Q. Do you recall any allegations in the	
7	operative complaint that said that the Rock 'n	
8	Play Sleeper was unsafe for all uses?	
9	A. I don't recall.	
10	Q. Have you ever heard heard of the 14:49	:36
11	Rock 'n Play Sleeper prior to taking on this	
12	assignment?	
13	A. Actually, yes.	
14	Q. When did you first learn of the Rock	
15	'n Play Sleeper prior to taking on this 14:49	:44
16	assignment?	
17	A. The very first time I ever heard of	
18	it, I have grandchildren and one of the	
19	grandchildren, the oldest or excuse me, the	
20	youngest of those grandchildren is now 14:49	:56
21	7-years-old. And I remember my my daughter,	
22	the mother of the the grandchildren	
23	mentioning that she had heard about the Rock 'n	
24	Play Sleeper because her younger son was colic	
25	and she we talked about that. For some 14:50	:22
	Page 195	

1	reason, my daughter thinks I may know a lot	
2	more about about how to handle babies than I	
3	do. She likes to talk to her father.	
4	Q. Did your daughter purchase the Rock 'n	
5	Play Sleeper? 14:50:	43
6	A. No, she did not.	
7	Q. How did she receive the Rock 'n Play	
8	Sleeper?	
9	A. I just said she didn't bought she	
10	didn't purchase it. 14:50:	52
11	Q. Did she receive it as a gift?	
12	A. Oh. She she did she has never	
13	owned the Rock 'n Play Sleeper.	
14	Q. Has she owned any other kind of	
15	incline sleeper product? 14:51:	02
16	A. Not to the best of my knowledge, no.	
17	I don't think so. She's a she's a	
18	registered nurse. She's a and she's a big	
19	researcher.	
20	Q. Do you know if she did any research in 14:51:	19
21	connection whether or not to purchase a Rock 'n	
22	Play Sleeper?	
23	A. I do not.	
24	Q. Do you know the reasons why she ended	
25	up not purchasing the Rock 'n Play Sleeper 14:51:	32
	Page 196	

1	after she spoke with you?	
2	MR. EUBANK: Object to the relevance.	
3	THE WITNESS: I have no idea why she	
4	didn't buy a product. She sometimes tell me	
5	why she does buy products. She rarely tells me 14:51:	45
6	about products she didn't didn't buy.	
7	BY MR. KANNY:	
8	Q. Other than the single conversation	
9	that you had with your daughter some time ago,	
10	have you had any other conversations with 14:52:	00
11	anybody about the Rock 'n Play Sleeper?	
12	A. I've had conversations about the Rock	
13	'n Play Sleeper with the counsel for the	
14	plaintiffs.	
15	Q. Outside of this litigation, sir? 14:52:	17
16	A. Outside of this litigation? No, I	
17	have no reason to do that.	
18	Q. Did you ever do any research in	
19	connection with the Rock 'n Play Sleeper prior	
20	to you being retained in this action? 14:52:	34
21	A. I may well, I'd just I'd be	
22	speculating. I can't I really can't answer	
23	that.	
24	Q. For what purposes would you have been	
25	doing research on the Rock 'n Play Sleeper? 14:52:	53
	Page 197	

- 1	
1	A. If I was if I did any research on
2	it, it would have been after my initial
3	conversation with the attorneys, which goes
4	back to January of 2020. I might have gone
5	online to see if I could learn little bit more 14:53:15
6	about the litigation. I frequently do that
7	when I'm contacted by lawyers about a case.
8	Q. You indicated that your daughter was a
9	registered nurse, and she does a lot of
10	research on buying products? 14:53:32
11	A. She she does a lot of homework,
12	yeah.
13	Q. What what kind of homework does she
14	do do she do in connection with purchasing
15	products, if you know? 14:53:41
16	MR. EUBANK: I'm going to say
17	objection to relevance and also objection that
18	this goes outside the scope of his assignment.
19	He was not asked to opine on what his
20	daughter's particular purchase habits are. 14:53:52
21	THE WITNESS: Yes and I what my
22	daughter does, I don't see it as being relevant
23	to my testimony today. And what I know of her
24	purchasing habits is between my daughter and I.
25	I don't believe that it that that 14:54:10
	Page 198

4.5		
1	Fisher-Price or anybody else	
2	BY MR. KANNY:	
3	Q. Your assignment was to	
4	A as a has a right has a right	
5	to ask me about that. 14:54:	20
6	Q. You were asked to opine as to what a	
7	reasonable consumer would consider material.	
8	Do you consider your daughter to be a	
9	reasonable consumer?	
10	A. I think my daughter is a is an 14:54:	31
11	average consumer, yes.	
12	Q. And your daughter does a lot of	
13	research in connection with purchasing	
14	products; is that your testimony?	
15	A. I I don't think said "a lot of." 14:54:	54
16	My daughter is a careful shopper. Nurses don't	
17	make that much money. And so, she's careful	
18	about what she purchases. And where	
19	appropriate, she tries to learn about the	
20	products she buys. She's not much of an 14:55:	16
21	impulse purchaser.	
22	Q. And that's pretty consistent with the	
23	reasonable consumer that you were evaluating in	
24	connection with your assignment in this case;	
25	right? 14:55:	31
	Page 199	

1	A. Not necessarily, no. Average
2	consumers looking my definition of a
3	reasonable consumer is an average consumer.
4	And my testimony is not about what average
5	consumers do, but rather what a what an 14:55:48
6	average consumer would take away from the
7	messaging conveyed by Fisher-Price about the
8	Rock 'n Play Sleep Sleeper. That's
9	Q. Right.
10	A. That's very much 14:56:04
11	Q. And
12	A. That's very much my expertise.
13	Q. Right. And I I get that, and we
14	talked about path of purchase and now you said
15	that your daughter is a reasonable consumer and 14:56:14
16	she does a lot of research prior to purchasing
17	products. And so I do think it's relevant as
18	to what she does or doesn't do. Do you know
19	whether she did any research in connection with
20	deciding whether or not to purchase the Rock 'n 14:56:31
21	Play Sleeper?
22	MR. EUBANK: Matt, this whole entire
23	line of questioning is totally out of bounds to
24	get into what one particular person in his
25	family that's not connected with this at all, 14:56:44
	Page 200

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 33 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	what their particular decision-making process	
2	is, because one person is not indicative of the	
3	entire class of people or a reasonable	
4	consumer, generally. I just don't see how this	
5	is	14:57:02
6	MR. KANNY: I are you going	
7	James, I'm running out of time. So are if	
8	you're going to instruct, instruct. If not,	
9	let me finish my questions. I think it's	
10	relevant because he's already testified that	14:57:11
11	his daughter is like a reasonable consumer as	
12	those that he was evaluating in this case.	
13	MR. EUBANK: I I'll note for the	
14	record and we we may file a motion to come	
15	back later and strike this as getting A,	14:57:26
16	it's speculative as to what he thinks his	
17	daughter might do because she is not the	
18	reasonable consumer as a term, she is an	
19	individual with her own individual drives and	
20	motivations. Beyond that, this is digging into	14:57:41
21	the personal life and family matters of an	
22	expert witness, not even a lay witness who is a	
23	plaintiff or fact witness in the case. And	
24	it's just totally out of bounds, in my opinion.	
25	MR. KANNY: Okay. Well, instruct or	14:57:58
	Pag	ge 201

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 34 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

not instruct, but let's get going. MR. EUBANK: I mean, it's it's it's not privileged and and it's not work product, so I am bound not to instruct him not to answer. I can just apologize to Mr. Silverman and say I wish you didn't have to answer, but please go ahead and answer.	8:10
<pre>it's not privileged and and it's not work product, so I am bound not to instruct him not to answer. I can just apologize to Mr. Silverman and say I wish you didn't have to</pre>	8:10
product, so I am bound not to instruct him not to answer. I can just apologize to 14:5 Mr. Silverman and say I wish you didn't have to	8:10
to answer. I can just apologize to 14:5 Mr. Silverman and say I wish you didn't have to	8:10
6 Mr. Silverman and say I wish you didn't have to	8:10
1.00 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 10 1	
7 answer, but please go ahead and answer.	
8 MR: KANNY: The court reporter can	
9 read	
THE WITNESS: So what question what 14:5	8:21
11 question do you want me to answer?	
MR. KANNY: If the court reporter	
could read the last question before the	
14 narrative.	
THE CERTIFIED STENOGRAPHER: Just a 14:5	8:32
16 moment.	
17 (Record read.)	
18 THE WITNESS: The answer is I don't	
19 know.	
20 BY MR. KANNY: 14:5	9:14
Q. She did contact you to talk about it;	
22 correct?	
A. She didn't contact me. We were	
visiting their house, and the baby was crying.	
Q. And what did you discuss about the 14:5	9:25
Page 202	

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 35 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

		$\overline{}$
1	Rock 'n Play Sleeper with your daughter at the	
2	time?	
3	MR. EUBANK: Objection. Goes outside	
4	the scope of his assignment.	
5	THE WITNESS: Boy, is it outside the 14:59:3	4
6	scope.	
7	My daughter asked if I ever had if	
8	any of our if any of her siblings had	
9	were difficult posed a difficult problem to	
10	my wife and I, you know, as far as, you know, 14:59:4	9
11	screaming, crying all the time. And my answer	
12	was yes. And she said what did you do. And I	
13	said we bought a baby swing. Now, this is a	
14	long time ago. My children are all grown up.	
15	BY MR. KANNY: 15:00:1	4
16	Q. Anything else that you can recall in	
17	that discussion about the Rock 'n Play Sleeper	
18	with your daughter?	
19	A. No. I think she I think she	
20	mentioned something called a Rock 'n Play 15:00:2	1
21	Sleeper, but that's as far as it goes.	
22	Q. What is your understanding of	
23	plaintiff's theory of liability in this case?	
24	A. My understanding of liability? My	
25	understanding of liability is is if 15:00:4	1
	Page 203	

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 36 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

5		
1	A. However, I have certainly been around.	
2	Q. That wasn't an that wasn't a	
3	question I answered your counsel, at the end	
4	of this, can ask you follow-up questions.	
5	A. Okay.	15:59:43
6	Q. Let's go to step one of the process.	
7	You say, "identify and consider demographics	
8	and psychographics"; correct?	
9	A. Yes.	
10	Q. What do you mean by "demographics"?	15:59:52
11	A. Demographics defined as sex, age,	
12	income, race, educational level, and geographic	
13	location.	
14	Q. What do you mean by "psychographics"?	
15	A. Psychographics is a marketing term, an	16:00:15
16	advertising term and it speaks to understanding	
17	the lifestyles and values of various consumer	
18	groups so that if you combine if you start	
19	to understand who the target audience is	
20	demographically, and then refine that based on	16:00:32
21	lifestyle and values, you have a very good	
22	sense of who the who the who this	
23	audience is, not as an audience, but rather	
24	thinking about them as an average consumer of	
25	within this target audience.	16:00:51
	Pac	ge 243

1	Q. What do you understand the				
2	demographics and psychographics of the putative				
3	class members of this case to be?				
4	A. I think the demographics can be				
5	anyone any any father and mother or	16:01:04			
6	mother and father or maybe just mother of of				
7	an infant child who has who is looking to				
8	solve a particular problem and that is do I				
9	I want to get something for my infant child to				
10	sleep in if they seem to need help. There are	16:01:25			
11	certainly other things that babies can sleep				
12	in, like bassinets. And from a demographic				
13	standpoint, it really crosses almost anybody				
14	who comes across in this case, comes across				
15	this product and can afford to buy.	16:01:45			
16	Q. Is it your understanding that only				
17	mothers and fathers are part of the putative				
18	class?				
19	A. No. I would imagine that the putative				
20	class would be anyone who had purchased the	16:01:56			
21	product, though not necessarily for their own				
22	use. I would imagine that, you know, this				
23	product would be a good gift item for for an				
24	expectant mother or newly or new parent.				
25	Friends could be giving it. Relatives could be	16:02:16			
	Page	244			

51					
1	giving it. Grandparents could be giving it.				
2	So those people could be giving it as well.				
3	It's a matter of finding out about it.				
4	Q. Are purchasers of the on the				
5	secondary market part of the putative class?	16:02:29			
6	A. I don't know.				
7	Q. Would they be would they fit in to				
8	the same demographics and psychographics of a				
9	purchasers who is purchasing it now?				
10	A. As I said, in my opinion, the	16:02:41			
11	demographic is were very, very broad here. You				
12	know, it's anybody who has either had a baby or				
13	wants to buy a, in essence, a gift for someone				
14	who recently had a baby. The psychographics				
15	are people who want to buy who kind of fit	16:03:01			
16	in to wanting to buy a a product that will				
17	solve a particular problem for for the				
18	mother and father of an infant.				
19	Q. You talk about, in step two, to apply				
20	your knowledge of consumer purchasing behavior	16:03:22			
21	as to the product or service being advertised				
22	in this case. How did you apply your knowledge				
23	in the way you specify in this particular case?				
24	A. I apply my in this case, I apply my				
25	knowledge of consumers who are buying products	16:03:38			
	Pag	e 245			

- 1		
1	for use by children or, for that matter, very	
2	small children, infants, babies. What what	
3	matters to me is it almost doesn't matter what	
4	the product is. It's what how consumers think	
5	about buying products for use by babies. 16:04	01
6	Babies are very precious. Parents,	
7	grandparents, friends all recognize that. So	
8	they want to buy products that are safe and	
9	that will be helpful and useful, at least for a	
10	period of time. Babies my understanding of 16:04	20
11	this product is that babies outgrow this	
12	product at a certain point.	
13	Q. And you have no experience, as we	
14	talked about it extensively earlier today, in	
15	durable baby products; correct? 16:04	33
16	A. Yes, I I I do. I just have a	
17	lot of experience with parents.	
18	Q. I'm sorry. Let me just make sure I	
19	get my answer clear. We testified you	
20	testified earlier that you have never worked on 16:04	52
21	a campaign or for manufacturers or retailers of	
22	durable baby products; is that correct?	
23	A. That's correct.	
24	Q. Okay. So you have no experience in	
25	connection with baby durable baby products; 16:05	12
	Page 246	

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 40 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	correct?
2	MR. EUBANK: Objection. Vague. What
3	type of experience?
4	BY MR. KANNY:
5	Q. You can go ahead and answer. 16:05:22
6	A. That's correct.
7	Q. Okay. Let's go to step three.
8	"Evaluate" so say you, then, "evaluate the
9	strategic appropriateness and clarify
10	clarity of the message as conveyed in the ad." 16:05:37
11	How do you conduct this evaluation?
12	A. The evaluation is conducted I
13	number 1, I use I use my experience to do
14	that. The strategic appropriateness, if I was
15	working at an ad agency, I would have a 16:05:52
16	strategy that had been developed and approved
17	through the client. In working on expert
18	witness cases like this, I have I have
19	generally speaking, and in this case
20	specifically, I have information that actually 16:06:09
21	came from the advertiser. And in this
22	instance, it's I was able to see that this
23	strategy was very, very clear. And the
24	strategy was to position this as a product that
25	could solve a problem for the parents of 16:06:27
	Page 247

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 41 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	infants that were keeping them awake at night.				
2	So the strategy was all based on a problem, and				
3	this product was the solution to this problem.				
4	And and the				
5	Q. Would you agree with me 16:06:46				
6	A. And then the second part of that				
7	sentence deals with clarity of messages				
8	conveyed, and that's where my experience, you				
9	know, basically is, is this message clear, is				
10	it simple, is it likely to confuse a consumer. 16:07:00				
11	And I all of those, at least in my opinion,				
12	I believe that the messages here were clear as				
13	a bell.				
14	Q. Would you agree me that the intent of				
15	the marketer doesn't necessarily mean that the 16:07:15				
16	perception of the consumer is consistent with				
17	that intent?				
18	A. Would I agree with that? Are you				
19	asking that in the abstract, or you asking				
20	specific to this case? 16:07:32				
21	Q. In the abstract.				
22	A. There are certainly I have				
23	experienced advertisers who insist on telling				
24	consumers what they want to say, as opposed to				
25	focusing in on determining on what consumers 16:07:48				
	Page 248				

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 42 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	want and need to hear or learn. So you can	
2	sometimes get a disconnect. Those are	
3	typically, those are not very good clients.	
4	And typically clients that insist on	
5	advertising that works that way, more often	16:08:07
6	than not not not 100 percent of the time,	
7	but more often than not the advertising that	
8	results from that is not as effective as	
9	another approach might be.	
10	Q. The fourth step is you considered the	16:08:19
11	totality of the advertisement is likely to	
12	engage the consumers. What standards do you	
13	use to determine whether a consumer will find	
14	the totality of the packaging engaging?	
15	A. Well, again, it's based on my	16:08:38
16	experience. One of the things for sure in	
17	advertising well, I guess I should never	
18	say for sure. Consumers look at babies in	
19	general. They like to see babies. But	
20	especially people who are buying products for	16:08:55
21	babies like to see babies. And they like to	
22	see babies portrayed in a way that they would	
23	hope their baby would sort of fit. I think	
24	everybody would love their baby to be pretty.	
25	I think they would like their baby to look	16:09:13
	Pag	ge 249

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 43 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

2 particularly infan	ally I think for for ts, they would like to see				
And the state of the second contract of the state of the second contract of the second cont	ts, they would like to see				
2 habias slassins ha					
3 babies sleeping ha	babies sleeping happily and like to see moms,				
4 and sometimes moms	and dads, enjoying that				
5 experience. So th	at kind of there's story 16:09:28				
6 appeal in that. A	nd this is not an				
7 intellectual react	ion, it's an emotional				
8 reaction that cons	umers have. And emotionally,				
9 they say, oh, I'm	attracted to that package.				
10 Now	16:09:47				
Q. Right. M	r. Silverman the question is				
12 what standard? No	t not				
A. Well, the	standard				
Q. Do you ha	ve an objective standard that				
you use in connect	ion in determining whether 16:09:53				
16 consumers will fin	d the totality of the package				
engaging, or are y	ou basing it on your years of				
18 experience and opi	nions?				
19 A. I'm basin	g it on my years of				
20 experience and wha	I was taught during my 16:10:05				
years of experience	∍.				
Q. And diffe	rent ad executives could have				
23 different opinions	regarding the				
24 appropriateness of	the packaging; correct?				
MR. EUBAN	K: Objection. Calls for 16:10:19				
	Page 250				

1	me.	
2	Q. And the highlighted sentence here,	
3	again, credits you with coining the term "Don't	
4	Leave Home Without It" for American Express; is	
5	that correct?	18:26:09
6	A. Yes.	
7	Q. Okay. Nothing further on those.	
8	There are many questions about whether or not	
9	you specifically worked in your marketing	
10	career on infant and toddler or baby durable	18:26:28
11	products.	
12	Do you recall those questions?	
13	A. Yes.	
14	Q. Well, not particularly working in	
15	depth with marketing campaigns for baby	18:26:42
16	durables, you've done a lot of work for other	
17	consumer products; is that correct?	
18	A. Most	
19	MR. KANNY: Objection. Vague.	
20	THE WITNESS: Most of my career has	18:26:52
21	been spent advertising consumer products and	
22	services.	
23	BY MR. EUBANK:	
24	Q. And you testified earlier that a lot	
25	of those included products that were marketed	18:27:03
	Pa	ge 324
		71.75

- 6					
1	to be either consumed or used by children?				
2	A. That is correct.				
3	Q. Okay. Would you say that it was				
4	consistent across well, I'll ask you: Was				
5	safety a concern or or was it material in 18:	27:21			
6	those categories that you worked in?				
7	A. Yes.				
8	Q. Any consumer products that you worked				
9	in on marketing or advertising for where people				
10	just didn't care about safety at all? 18:	27:42			
11	A. Gosh. That's an interesting question.				
12	I I'm not sure how much consumers worried				
13	about safety when opening a Pabst Blue Ribbon				
14	or Hamm's or Lone Star Beer or eating an ice				
15	cream cone at Baskin-Robbins. But in general, 18:	28:05			
16	consumers expect they want they want safe				
17	products and they believe the products they buy				
18	from well-known, well represented, effectively				
19	rounded companies, generally speaking they				
20	believe that those to be safe. 18:	28:23			
21	Q. And consumers across those consumer				
22	products that you worked on, did they expect				
23	the product to be usable for the purpose stated				
24	on the label?				
25	MR. KANNY: Objection. Calls for 18:	28:44			
	Page 32	5			

1	speculation. Lacks foundation.
2	BY MR. EUBANK:
3	Q. Based on based on your experience.
4	A. In my experience, if when consumers
5	buy a product that has been positioned as being 18:28:52
6	for specific purpose or primarily for a
7	specific purpose, they expect that product to
8	deliver on that specific purpose.
9	Q. And along those lines when we when
10	there was a discussion multiple times about 18:29:09
11	Double Stuf Oreos?
12	A. Yes.
13	Q. Do you recall those discussions?
14	And you stated, if I recall, that that
15	the doubled stuff is a material representation 18:29:19
16	to consumers; correct?
17	A. I believe it was a material it was
18	an attribute that was a material benefit to
19	consumers.
20	Q. Okay. And does that attribute matter 18:29:31
21	to somebody who doesn't want a cookie?
22	A. No. It doesn't matter people that
23	don't want a cookie.
24	Q. So whether it's Double Stuf or not,
25	it's the Oreo part that first gets the consumer 18:29:43
	Page 326

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 47 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	STATE OF CALIFORNIA)
) SS.
2	COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES)
3	
4	
5	I, BRUCE SILVERMAN, HEREBY CERTIFY UNDER
6	PENALTY OF PERJURY UNDER THE LAWS OF THE STATE OF
7	CALIFORNIA THAT THE FOREGOING IS TRUE AND CORRECT.
8	EXECUTED THIS 19th DAY OF November ,
9	2021, AT Studio City , CALIFORNIA.
10	
11	
12	
13	Bull
14	/~man
15	BRUCE SILVERMAN
16	
17	
18	
19	
2 0	
21	
22	
23	
24	
2 5	
	Page 367

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 48 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

			ACCUSANCE PRINCIPLE TOTAL CONTROL SECTION IN THE POST OF SECTION OF SECTION SE	
1		ERRATA SH	EET FOR THE DEPOSIT	ION OF:
2				
3	CASE NAM	E: I	N RE: ROCK 'N PLAY	SLEEPER
		M	ARKETING, SALES PRA	CTICES, AND
4		F	RODUCTS LIABILITY L	ITIGATION
5	CASE NUM	BER: 1	:19-MD-2903	
6	DEPO DAT	E: I	HURSDAY, OCTOBER 28	, 2021
7	DEPONENT	: E	RUCE SILVERMAN	
8				
9			CORRECTIONS	
10	PG. LN.	NOW READS	SHOULD READ	REASONS
11	58 4	table	label	Reporter error
12	70 8	until	through 	Misspoke
13	78 16	principl	e principal	Reporter error
14	91 25	advertis	ement advertiser	Misspoke
15	92 6	advise	advice	Reporter error
16	134 20	interest	ing interested	Misspoke
17	150 6	is	was	Misspoke
18	159 18	parent	part	Reporter error
19	168 4	advertis	ing advertisers	Reporter error
20	168 21	service	focus groups	Possibly misspoke or reporter error
21	185 14	financia	l final	Reporter error
22	189 20	non-pack	ing non-packaging	Reporter error
23		CONTINUED	ON FOLLOWING PAGE	
24		1	Λ	
25	SIGNATUR	E //	M DATE	E
				Page 368

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 49 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	ERRATA SHEET FOR THE DEPOSITION OF:
2	
3	CASE NAME: IN RE: ROCK 'N PLAY SLEEPER
	MARKETING, SALES PRACTICES, AND
4	PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION
5	CASE NUMBER: 1:19-MD-2903
6	DEPO DATE: THURSDAY, OCTOBER 28, 2021
7	DEPONENT: BRUCE SILVERMAN
8	
9	PAGE 2 OF CORRECTIONS
10	PG. LN. NOW READS SHOULD READ REASONS
11	190 12 Dennis Kivetz Reporter error
12	190 14 Dennis Kivetz Reporter error
13	254 22 product package Misspoke
14	269 22 insert "and" after "packaging" Clarity
15	274 12 demand define Reporter error
16	THIS SPACE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK
17	308 10 correct connect Reporter error
18	325 19 rounded branded Reporter error
19	337 16 sleep slept Reporter error
20	353 16 markets marketers Reporter error
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	SIGNATURE / MUM DATE 11/19/2021
	100
	Page 368

```
1
            CERTIFIED STENOGRAPHER'S CERTIFICATE
2
      STATE OF CALIFORNIA )
                           ) SS.
     COUNTY OF LOS ANGELES )
3
4
5
            I, NATALIE PARVIZI-AZAD, HERBY CERTIFY:
6
            I AM A DULY OUALIFIED CERTIFIED SHORTHAND
7
     REPORTER IN THE STATE OF CALIFORNIA, HOLDER OF
     CERTIFICATE NUMBER CSR 14125 ISSUED BY THE COURT
8
    REPORTERS BOARD OF CALIFORNIA AND WHICH IS IN FULL
9
     FORCE AND EFFECT. (BUS. & PROF. § 8016)
10
11
            I AM NOT FINANCIALLY INTERESTED IN THIS
12
     ACTION AND NOT A RELATIVE OR EMPLOYEE OF ANY
13
    ATTORNEY OF THE PARTIES, OR OF ANY OF THE PARTIES.
    (CIV. PROC. § 2025.320(A))
14
15
            I AM AUTHORIZED TO ADMINISTER OATHS OR
     AFFIRMATIONS PURSUANT TO CALIFORNIA CODE OF CIVIL
16
17
     PROCEDURE, SECTION 2093 (B) AND PRIOR TO BEING
     EXAMINED, THE DEPONENT WAS FIRST PLACED UNDER OATH
18
19
     OR AFFIRMATION BY ME. (CIV. PROC. §§ 2025.320,
20
     2025.540(A))
21
            I AM THE CERTIFIED OFFICER THAT
     STENOGRAPHICALLY RECORDED THE TESTIMONY IN THE
22
23
    FOREGOING PROCEEDING AND THE FOREGOING TRANSCRIPT
24
     IS A TRUE RECORD OF THE TESTIMONY GIVEN. (CIV.
     PROC. § 2025.540(A))
25
```

Page 369

Case 1:19-cv-00512-GWC Document 218-4 Filed 01/13/22 Page 51 of 51 CONFIDENTIAL

1	I HAVE NOT, AND SHALL NOT, OFFER OR PROVIDE
2	ANY SERVICES OR PRODUCTS TO ANY PARTY'S ATTORNEY
3	OR THIRD PARTY WHO IS FINANCING ALL OR PART OF THE
4	ACTION WITHOUT FIRST OFFERING SAME TO ALL PARTIES
5	OR THEIR ATTORNEYS ATTENDING THE PROCEEDING AND
6	MAKING SAME AVAILABLE AT THE SAME TIME TO ALL
7	PARTIES OR THEIR ATTORNEYS. (CIV. PROC §
8	2025.320(B))
9	I SHALL NOT PROVIDE ANY SERVICE OR PRODUCT
10	CONSISTING OF THE CERTIFIED STENOGRAPHER'S
11	NOTATIONS OR COMMENTS REGARDING THE DEMEANOR OF
12	ANY WITNESS, ATTORNEY, OR PARTY PRESENT AT THE
13	PROCEEDING TO ANY PARTY OR ANY PARTY'S ATTORNEY OR
14	THIRD PARTY WHO IS FINANCING ALL OR PART OF THE
15	ACTION, NOR SHALL I COLLECT ANY PERSONAL
16	IDENTIFYING INFORMATION ABOUT THE WITNESS AS A
17	SERVICE OR PRODUCT TO BE PROVIDED TO ANY PARTY OR
18	THIRD PARTY WHO IS FINANCING ALL OR PART OF THE
19	ACTION. (CIV. PROC. § 2025.320(C))
20	DATED: NOVEMBER 5, 2021
21	
22	
23	1 Pour · ·
24	My was
25	NATALIE PARVIZI-AZAD, CSR NO.14125
	Page 370